

Social Audit Report under the MCP&PSSSA Act 2017-12-06
17th – 22nd November 2017

1. Name of Village, Block, District: Mawsmai Jorabad, Umling, Ri Bhoi

2. Name of members of Social Audit Support Team:

- a. MSSAT Representative: Kyrmen.
- b. External Resource Person: Karuna M., Himan Patra
- c. Village Resource Persons: Banisha Lyngkhoi, Rikyntiew Jitem
- d. Social Audit Committee (if it was formed): They said an 8 member team was formed but were not given the list of people

3. Composition of Social Audit Public Hearing Panel

Name	Designation
R. Kharbihkiew	BDO
R. Shakwa	Headman
K.lyngkhoi	DSARP,MSSAT

There was no representative from either the ADC or an NGO from a neighbouring block. Most representatives from departments were sitting in the table. This did not allow for a clear separation between the panel and the others.

4. Number of people who attended the Public Hearing: Around 200

5. List of Departments which did not set up desks at the Public Hearing

Election Department (Many people wanted voter IDs), EB department,

6. List of schemes audited by the team in the village: PDS, ICDS, MDM, SSA, MGNREGS, PHE, Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan, Veterinary Services, Health, EB

7. Key Findings:

Name of scheme that was audited	Key findings (Please answer with specific issues listed)	Decision taken at the Public Hearing
PDS	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Rice Sold at 5 Rs/kg instead of 3 Rs/kg2) Rice available only for 2 days in a month. If people do not have money at the time when rice is sold, then they will miss it.3) 1200 lts of Kerosene are supplied every month to 3 dealers in the village (There are only around 330 cards, so only 660 lts should be supplied). One dealer get 400 lts every month for 100 families, the other two also get 400 lts each but this is meant for 200 families each!3) Kerosene distribution particulars are not recorded in the ration cards4) Most families do not get kerosene. We got the registers from the 3 dealers and then did house-to-	Kerosene dealers promised that they will supply kerosene to all families in the future

	<p>house verification of 11 numbers of families from R.Shakwa Kerosene fair price shop received 2liter @ 25 per Litres where as in the Register it mention 4 Litres and 3households were not received but reflect in the register. From S. Matlang kerosene Fair price shop from the 9 number of house hold verified as per register verification 3liters issued @25 per litres but as per finding only 1house received only 2 litres and 8 of them not received but reflect in the record and from M. Shakwa the beneficiaries is received as per record in the registers.</p> <p>5) There are many families which have been living in the village for a long time but have not received ration cards yet.</p> <p>6) Sugar, Kerosene and Atta are also supplied at a higher rate than fixed by the government.</p>	
Election Commission	<p>There are many families who have not received their voter IDs even though they have been living there for a long time. Voter IDs are required for people to get ration cards.</p>	
PHE	<p>1) Water is a huge issue in this village not just for the people, but also for all the cows that they rear. The Department spent nearly 2 crores and implemented a project 10 years ago but the people received water only for a few weeks. The department claims that it stopped working because the pipes were broken during the 4 lane of the highway close by and that they have now sent a new proposal for Rs 11 crores which however has not been approved by the government. People however have said that it's a shame that the previous project was a failure and without looking to fix that or to come up with local solutions, the department is now blaming the government for not sanctioning an expensive proposal.</p> <p>2) As per official records, 193 people were provided support for building toilets under <u>Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan in 2014 (1000 Rs each)</u>. The team was able to meet 114 people. The others had either migrated or were fake names. Among the 114 people that were met, 64 people said that they did not receive any support for building their toilet. 48 people said that they received material (most had received only a toilet basin, pipe and 2 tin sheets; few others received half a bag of cement and some sand) – the value of this would be around 1000 Rs only. 2 people said that toilets were completely constructed for them.</p> <p>It's most likely that the households that were not met by the teams were fake. Hence, it's important</p>	<p>1) The department will meet the village water and sanitation committee and try to come up with cost-effective solution which will address the needs of the villagers</p> <p>2) Money will be recovered and action will be taken on the officials.</p>

	<p>that the amount sanctioned to these people be categorized as misappropriation and marked for recovery. The implementation people may provide proof that to show that some of these toilets were built and so the amount need not be paid back. Since the value of goods given to few people was only one tenth of the amount sanctioned, the remaining amount should also be recovered.</p>	
ICDS	<p>1) The three anganwadis were not functional – pre-school education was not given to children nor were they given a hot-cooked meal every day. Take home rations were given to a few mothers and to pregnant/nursing women but this was also irregularities.</p> <p>2) Anganwadi workers and helpers have not been paid for the last 6 months.</p> <p>3) Separate space is not available for two anganwadis; they are run from the workers’ home which is one of the reasons for the poor functioning</p> <p>4) There is no anganwadi in 10th mile even though there are many children living here.</p> <p>5) ICDS registers were written in pencil.</p>	<p>1) Anganwadi centers will be made functional – pre-school education will be provided for 4 hours every day; a hot cooked meal will be provided every day and appropriate quantity of take home rations will be given to all eligible people</p> <p>2) Charts will be displayed giving the entitlements for different groups</p> <p>3) Anganwadi committee will be formed as per norms, meeting will be held regularly and this committee will monitor the functioning of the anganwadi</p> <p>4) Steps will be taken to build anganwadi centers for the two that are currently functioning from the workers’ homes.</p>
MDM	<p>The team visited Suryodaya school (private school supported by government);</p> <p>1) There are 207 children in the primary school but rations for MDM are supplied only for 130 students</p> <p>2) There are 100 students in the upper primary but rations for MDM are supplied only for 77 students</p>	<p>This is the situation across most schools in the district. The MDM officer said that he will write a report about this and give it to his superiors</p>
SSA	<p>1) There are 207 children in the primary school but only two teachers are supported by the government when actually there should be 7 teachers as per RTE norms.</p> <p>2) The upper primary school is also short of There are no government schools close by and even poor students have to go only to Suryodaya school; Some of the parents are unable to pay the school fees.</p> <p>3) Suryodaya school also has significant infrastructure needs (class rooms)</p> <p>4) Access road to school is very steep and uneven. It should be built under MGNREGS</p>	<p>The government should consider paying the school fees for the students who come from poor families or start a school nearby which will provide free education as per RTE norms</p>
Health	<p>1) The previous ASHA was no functional. New ASHAs have been appointed but have not been</p>	<p>Senior VHN said that training will be provided to ASHAs,</p>

	<p>provided any training yet.</p> <p>2) The Village Health Nutrition and Sanitation Committee is not functional since 2011.</p> <p>3) Village Health and Nutrition Day is not held every month</p> <p>4) The VHNs do not visit the village at a fixed time even once a month</p> <p>5) People have very low confidence with the Meghalaya health system and they use the facilities at Sonapur District hospital in Assam even though this would mean that their child would get a birth certificate from Assam.</p> <p>6) PHC doctor mentioned that they get roughly half the number of drugs that they place indent for.</p> <p>7) The operation theatre at Nongpoh is not functional and so for any emergency people have to go to Shillong. The district hospital also does not have scan facilities</p>	<p>VHNSC will be formed and given training and financial support to make it operational and those they will specify a specific date and time in a month when the Village Health Nutrition Day will be held.</p>
Veterinary	<p>1) Other than Artificial Insemination, no other veterinary services are provided in this village even though most households are involved in dairy farming.</p> <p>2) Artificial Insemination is supposed to be provided at Rs 30, but the people are charged Rs 150</p>	<p>The veterinary doctor shared his name and phone number and said that he will come at least once a month to the village to find out whether there is any disease outbreak among the cows.</p> <p>He also said that he will talk to the officer in charge about the over-charging that happens for artificial insemination</p>
MGNREGS	<p>1) Muster Rolls are not maintained at the worksite. Even kaccha rolls are not maintained. There is no record of the people who worked in the last two weeks. Muster rolls will be filled at a later date and there is enormous potential for adding names of people who did not work</p> <p>2) There are many families which have gotten double the wages that they were entitled to while there are many others who have still not got it.</p> <p>3) There are many fake entries – people who did not work but who were paid. While most families have gotten only 12 or 24 days, there are a few families which have received payment for much higher number of days. This is theoretically impossible since the village has a rule that only one person per family can work at a time. So, these were fake entries which were added later.</p> <p>4) The Village Secretary (Anil Doloi) is the vendor.</p> <p>5) Interlocking bricks for the road were bought at Rs 20 / brick but many people said the quality of</p>	<p>BDO said that he will look into these issues and address them</p>

	<p>the brick is poor and would have cost only Rs 14 / brick</p> <p>6) Work culture is quite poor – people apparently work for very short hours</p> <p>7) There are many works that can be taken up in the village but due to poor planning, only one work has been taken up this year.</p> <p>8) The VMC is not functional</p> <p>9) Job Cards are empty – they do not have details about days worked and wages earned</p> <p>10) Due to lack of individual bank accounts for all working members in the family, some workers work on behalf of their family member who has an account. This can lead to fudging of muster rolls and should be discouraged. It should be insisted that only workers who are present in the job cards can work.</p> <p>11) There are many families which would like to get job cards and families who would like to add additional members to their existing job cards.</p>	
Power Department	<p>1) The supply is very erratic</p> <p>2) The bill is not generated based on actual readings – no person comes to record the reading</p> <p>3) Electricity Supply is cut for many houses even if only a few had not paid the bill</p> <p>4) People have used bamboo poles since the department did not install concrete poles for many of the houses on the road to Killing</p>	No representative from the department was present

Overall, the Nepali community which is the majority here feels excluded from all decisions taken for the development of the village. Most committees (Anganwadi, VHNSC, VHSC, VMC, PDS monitoring committee) are not functional. Most people do not have any identity card and would like to get a ration card.

8. Applications filed by people to avail benefits/services:

Sl no	Name of applicant	Name of service applied for
1	Bina Mokor	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
2	Belmaya Thapa	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
3	Sopna Chetri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
4	Pushpa Pradhan	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
5	Jelykumari Devi Sharma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
6	Sabitri Marak	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
7	Puja Sharma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
8	Micheal K.Marak	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
9	Yogita K.Marak	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
10	Rajesh Biswakarma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
11	Karan Marak	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
12	Ponam Marak	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
13	Dev Marak	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached

14	Biba Sharma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
15	Rita Sharma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
16	Monkumari Sharma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
17	Juna Begam	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
18	Minu Sangma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
19	Povitra Sharma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
20	Radhika Sapkata	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
21	Maya Chetri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
22	Mina Sharma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
23	Roma Chetri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
24	Bim Bahadur Bhujel	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
25	Saraswati Bhusal	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
26	Komla Barman	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
27	Ganga Lama Thapa	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
28	Jyoti Chakraborty	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
29	Sangita Chakraborty	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
30	Meena Brahma	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
31	Tara Sapkota	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
32	Rikmenlin Nongbri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application attached
33	Sabita Chetri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application Attached
34	Rita Chetri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application Attached
35	Meena Chetri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application Attached
36	Dhanraj Chetri	Application for PDS (Ration) Application Attached
37	Pakuli Daimary	Application for PDS (Ration) Application Attached
38	Plodish Marak	Attached Application to Include all Household members in the card
1	Bishnu Singh Mawsmmai Jorabad	Application for Pension
2	Bishnu Maya Joshi	Application for Widow & Old Age Pension.
3	Junu Devi	Application for Old Age pension
2	Khem Kumari Khadal	Application for Old Age pension
3	Lekhnath Khadal	Application for Old Age pension
4	Karna Bahadur Bhujel	Application for Old Age pension
5	Joy Lal Kafle	Application for Old Age pension
6	Himkala Ghimire	Application for Widow Pension
7	Kamala Sharma	Application for Old Age Widow pension
8	Parbati Sharma	Application for Widow pension
9	Maloti Chetri	Application for Old Age pension
1	Mawsmmai Jorabad VEC copies attached.	Village Plan from Mawsmmai Jorabad VEC.
2	16 nos of House holds applicant	Application for Toilet Attached
3	Mawsmmai VIP Colony	Application for foothpath
1	Khemu Chettri	Application for Job Card attached
2	Rita Bhujel	Application for Job Card attached
3	Silbor Doloi	Application for Job Card attached
4	Girish Das	Application for Job Card attached
5	Mina Chetri	Application for Job Card attached

6	Poja Rai Sharma	Application for Job Card attached
7	Madhu Regmi	Application for Job Card attached
8	Gonesh Subedi	Application for Job Card attached
9	Manoj Basnet	Application for Job Card attached
10	Mami Bahadur Chetri	Application for Job Card attached
11	Naras Chetri	Application for Job Card attached
12	Rita Dhakal	Application for Job Card attached
13	Narayan Devkota	Application for Job Card attached
14	Bishnu Maya Chetri	Application for Job Card attached
15	Raju Chetri	Application for Job Card attached
16	Robina Doloi	Application for Job Card attached
17	Sabita Chetri	Application for Job Card attached
18	Suma Chetri	Application for Job Card attached
19	Rita Chetri	Application for Job Card attached
20	Shobha Poudel	Application for Job Card attached
21	Tika Kala	Application for Job Card attached
22	Mohan Bhatrai	Application for Job Card attached
23	Tuli Chetri	Application for Job Card attached

1	Kali Charan tamang	Application for Voter ID card attached
2	Temala Thapa	Application for Voter ID card attached
3	Rita Chakraborty	Application for Voter ID card attached
4	Purna Thakuri	Application for Voter ID card attached
5	Karna Bahadur Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
6	Dil Bahadur Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
7	Mena Kumari Rana	Application for Voter ID card attached
8	Jyoti Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
9	Rani Marak	Application for Voter ID card attached
10	Sita Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
11	Diliram Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
12	Rajkumari Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
13	Dibakar Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
14	Parbati Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
15	Amrit Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
16	Minu Dural	Application for Voter ID card attached
17	Sita Marasini	Application for Voter ID card attached
18	Givinda Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
19	Gauri Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
20	Durga Devi Dhakal	Application for Voter ID card attached
21	Hima Bhujel	Application for Voter ID card attached
22	Rila Dhakal	Application for Voter ID card attached
23	Kusum Kafle	Application for Voter ID card attached
24	Bishnu Singh	Application for Voter ID card attached
25	Sita Adhikari	Application for Voter ID card attached
26	Debimaya Devi	Application for Voter ID card attached
27	Asha Begum	Application for Voter ID card attached
28	Ajita Upadhya	Application for Voter ID card attached
29	Rahul Chaudri	Application for Voter ID card attached
30	Ishwari Bhattari	Application for Voter ID card attached

31	Juma Begum	Application for Voter ID card attached
32	Krishna Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
33	Mon Kumari Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
34	Radhika Thapa	Application for Voter ID card attached
35	Shobha Pondel	Application for Voter ID card attached
36	Monta Dukpa	Application for Voter ID card attached
37	Bhim Bdr Bhujel	Application for Voter ID card attached
38	Kumari gurung	Application for Voter ID card attached
39	Binuka Bhujel	Application for Voter ID card attached
40	Prakash Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
41	Bishnu Adhikari	Application for Voter ID card attached
42	Maya Adhikari	Application for Voter ID card attached
43	Meena Thapa	Application for Voter ID card attached
44	Maloti Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
45	Rita Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
46	Dharmaj Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
47	Hari Bhadur Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
48	Nirmala Adhikari	Application for Voter ID card attached
49	Pratap Rai	Application for Voter ID card attached
50	Bhagwati Ghihire	Application for Voter ID card attached
51	Tikakal Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
52	Radhika Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
53	Lila Das	Application for Voter ID card attached
54	Ranesh Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
55	Devi Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
56	Parash Pandey	Application for Voter ID card attached
57	Suma Chetri	Application for Voter ID card attached
58	Rita Sharma	Application for Voter ID card attached
59	Bishnu Maya Adhikari	Application for Voter ID card attached
60	Uma Devi Sapkota	Application for Voter ID card attached
61	Mina Magur	Application for Voter ID card attached

9. Grievances/Complaint registered by people indicating irregularity in implementation:

Sl no	Name of complainant	Description of grievance/complaint
1	114 nos of complain, Name and signature attached.	Complain against NBS implemented on 2014
2	19 nos of complain from Jorabad, application attached	Complain against distance from the Distribution place, Quantity of kerosene and price of rice and
3	26 nos of complain from 10 Mile under Jorabad Mawsmal. Application Attached.	Complain against the rate and Quantity of PDS, Kerosene and supply of Sugar not regularly.
4	13 nos of complain from 10 Mile under Jorabad Mawsmal. Application Attached.	1. Complain against water problems since the last 15 years, 2. Non regular supply of Electricity in the village, 3. No proper services from the Veterinary Department in the village and 4. Affected by Air pollution from the factory.

5	21 nos of complain from 10 Mile under Jorabad Mawsmai. Application Attached.	Request for New Anganwadi Center in 10 mile as more children were left out.
6	20 nos of complain, Name, Job card nos and signature attached.	Not yet received of wages for F/Y 2016-17 under MGNREGS

10. Based on the social audit findings, please list down **policy level suggestions** that you would like be incorporated in the implementation of schemes that were audited:-

- a) There are many people in the village who are living there for a long time but do not have voter IDs. A special camp should be organized so that people can get their Voter IDs in an easy manner.
- b) There are many people in the village who are living there for a long time but do not have Ration Cards. A special camp should be organized so that people can get their Ration Cards in an easy manner. Since voter IDs are required for the ration card application, the Voter ID camp should be done first and then the ration card camp may be held.
- c) Strengthen village level committees – the committees should be constituted by the community in a public forum as per norms, the committee members should be given training (either in a class room or in the village by government field staff), field staff should participate in the committee meetings often and facilitate discussion and decisions.
- d) ICDS centers are non-functional. Supervisors and CDPOs are not able to fix this. Maybe the anganwadi committee should be strengthened to monitor the centers and directly report to the district or state regarding issues at their centers. Good posters with clear entitlements should be prepared and pasted in public locations. Maybe entitlements for each child / woman can be given in packets rather than the practice followed currently where the anganwadi opens a bulk package and distributes a specific quantity (such as 763 gms of atta / week for every pregnant or nursing mother). Since the quantity is not easy to remember and people do not know this, it paves the way for pilfering.
- e) Greater transparency is required in the implementation of the schemes. This could have prevented the scam in the implementation of the Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan scheme in the village. Field level functionaries should give information about all schemes and amounts sanctioned to committee members and not just to individuals in the village. Pro-active disclosures should be done for all schemes through wall paintings or posters.
- f) PDS – Everyone should get their entitlements at the price specified in the NFSA. If dealers are not given sufficient incentives, then this needs to be addressed so that they do not use this as an excuse to get extra money from the people.
- g) Kerosene distribution details should also be entered in the ration card or a separate card should be given to the people.
- h) Health – Regular community outreach work needs to be done to regain the trust of the community. Today, most people are using the services in Assam but there are many problems associated with this – birth certificate from Assam which people do not want, lack of accountability (if there are any serious problems tomorrow, Assam will just say it happened in Meghalaya and that it's not responsible), incorrect health data (for instance there were 8 home deliveries in this village from 2015 onwards but the VHN said these children were born in hospitals in Assam which is difficult to verify)
- i) MGNREGS – Key mandated processes and procedures are not being followed. This has led to fake entries as well as expensive material procurement. Awareness levels

among community about their entitlements and the different types of works that can be taken is very low. Strict instructions should be given to follow processes. Participatory Planning to select appropriate works should be done in a systematic manner to ensure that useful assets especially relating to drinking water are built.

- j) Village level social audit committees need to be formed and provided training to carry forward the process.

11. Based on the pilot social audit, please list down the **changes** that you would like be made to the **social audit protocol** that was followed in the pilot and to the **formats** that were used:-

- a) Individual verification of all beneficiaries of all schemes will take too much time and is not feasible during the time allotted for the social audit. As far as possible, verification should be done in group meetings.
- b) Information collection from certain departments need not be done ahead of time (the team can look at the registers in the village)
- c) Workbooks have to be simpler – not all formats in workbook should be filled. Depending on the circumstance, some forms can be skipped.
- d) Village level Social Audit Committee may be formed during the public hearing
- e) Public Hearing panel composition – should have one senior District level representative, one CSO representative from neighbouring block, one Autonomous District Council and 2 other people
- f) During the social audit process, the team should meet with each of the village level committees
- g) During the social audit, selection of beneficiaries, planning for next year may also be done
- h) Social Audit Unit should collect applications from people and give receipts during the social audit process itself; This should not be postponed till the public hearing day since there is usually a huge crowd and registering grievances is difficult at that time.